



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
-----------------	-------------	----------------------	---------------------	------------------

10/785,082

02/25/2004

Jessica E. Barzilai

07414.0009-01

8544

22852

7590

01/22/2009

FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW, GARRETT & DUNNER
LLP

901 NEW YORK AVENUE, NW
WASHINGTON, DC 20001-4413

EXAMINER

SIEFKE, SAMUEL P

ART UNIT

PAPER NUMBER

1797

MAIL DATE

DELIVERY MODE

01/22/2009

PAPER

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Office Action Summary	Application No.	Applicant(s)	
	10/785,082	BARZILAI ET AL.	
	Examiner	Art Unit	
	SAM P. SIEFKE	1797	

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 23 October 2008.
- 2a) ☒ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☐ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 49-60 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 49-60 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- | | |
|--|---|
| 1) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) | 4) <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413) |
| 2) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) | Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____ |
| 3) <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08) | 5) <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application |
| Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____ | 6) <input type="checkbox"/> Other: _____ |

DETAILED ACTION

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102

The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless –

(b) the invention was patented or described in a printed publication in this or a foreign country or in public use or on sale in this country, more than one year prior to the date of application for patent in the United States.

Claims 49-60 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by Suzuki et al. (USPN 4,981,801).

Suzuki discloses a system comprising a thermal cycling device (fig. 7, ref. 71-75) having a sample block with a plurality of openings for receiving a sample well tray (88); a sample well tray handling apparatus (fig. 7-10) configured to take a sample well tray from a first location, place the sample well tray into the thermal cycling device at a second location and then later remove the sample well tray from the thermal cycling device and return the sample well tray to the first location (col. 11, lines 18-col. 12, lines 67); the sample well tray handling apparatus comprising a sample well tray holder (90), a rotational actuator (fig. 8, ref. 93 and fig. 9) configured to rotate the sample well tray holder, and an extension arm (90) extending from the rotational actuator and being connected (89) to the sample well tray holder. Regarding claim 47, the Examiner states that when the sample well tray is taken from the thermal cycling device the sample well tray holder (90) urges the sample well tray in a direction away from the sample block of the thermal cycling device because it picks up and moves to another station. Regarding

Art Unit: 1797

claim 48, a robot with a robotic arm configured to transport the sample well tray to the first location is disclosed in fig. 2).

Response to Arguments

Applicant's arguments filed 10/23/08 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive. Applicant argues, "The system includes "a thermal cycling device generally defining a horizontal cross-sectional area and comprising a sample block ... for receiving the sample well tray." The system also includes "a sample well tray handling apparatus comprising: a sample well tray holder [and] a rotational actuator configured to rotate the sample well tray holder about a rotational axis ..., wherein the sample well tray handling apparatus is configured to move the sample well tray from a first location outside the cross-sectional area to a second location inside the cross-sectional area and then later remove the sample well tray from the second location to the first location." As detailed below, Suzuki does not teach or otherwise suggest the subject matter of claim 49." The Examiner has carefully reviewed the claim limitations of 49 and states that the limitation that defines a thermal cycling device generally defining a *horizontal cross-sectional area* and comprises a *sample block inside the cross-sectional area for receiving the sample well tray* can be interpreted as a general horizontal cross section are that surrounds the sample block in Suzuki seen in figure 8. The Examiner states that since defining a horizontal cross section area around a sample block can be designated as just a horizontal cross section that surrounds the sample block 72 and not the entire area as the Applicant has interpreted figure 8 of Suzuki. Therefore as

Art Unit: 1797

seen in figure 8, the sample tray (as seen in figure 8, first location) is outside this horizontal cross section area (a general area that surrounds only sample block 72) that surrounds sample block 72 but is moved into the horizontal cross sectional area when the sample tray is placed in the sample block 72.

Conclusion

Applicant's amendment necessitated the new ground(s) of rejection presented in this Office action. Accordingly, **THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL**. See MPEP § 706.07(a). Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire **THREE MONTHS** from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within **TWO MONTHS** of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after the end of the **THREE-MONTH** shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than **SIX MONTHS** from the date of this final action.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to SAM P. SIEFKE whose telephone number is (571)272-1262. The examiner can normally be reached on M-F 7:00am-5:00pm.

Art Unit: 1797

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Jill A. Warden can be reached on 571-272-1700. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

/Samuel P Siefke/
Primary Examiner, Art Unit 1797